

Cut and Shut: The Hybridity of Cantiga 173

Stephen Parkinson
Oxford University

Introduction

The *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, composed in Galician and set to music at the court of Alfonso X o Sabio in the third quarter of the 13th century, have for many years been anthologised, recorded and commented on from the shelter of a number of cosy assumptions. These have included the belief that the most extensive manuscript, MS E, could be considered a genuine *codex princeps*, and that the editions based on it –the textual editions of Mettmann (1959-72; 1986-89) and the musical edition of Angles–complemented by the illustrative miniatures of the *códice rico* T¹ (Edilán, Testimonio), were a definitive and complete account. Recent work by Ferreira (1998, 2000, 2009) on the music, Schaffer (1999, 2000) and Parkinson (2000a, b) on the MSS, and Bertolucci (2000), Parkinson (1987, 1998, 2007, 2010b) and Montero Santalha (2003) on the texts, have cast doubt on these certainties, and have identified some cases where E is not the best source, and others where none of the sources is correct, and have begun to identify the processes which governed Alfonso’s *Cantigas* project (Parkinson & Jackson). The current paper is part of this revisionist program.

The Problem with Cantiga 173

There is something badly wrong with the text of cantiga 173, reproduced in (1) below in the editorial style of the Oxford critical edition of the CSM.²

The *cantiga* tells the tale of a man who suffered from kidney stones, and who turns to the Virgin when medicine fails him. He makes a pilgrimage to the healing shrine of Salas, and awakes from sleep to find that he has passed a massive kidney stone (‘tan grande que verdadeira / ment’ era come castanna’). This apparently simple *cantiga* appears to have a major lacuna between its third and fourth strophes. The third strophe ends with a possibly incomplete invocation by the man to the Virgin ‘que non catass’

¹ The four MSS are represented by the following sigla:

To: Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, MS 10069.

E: Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de S. Lorenzo de El Escorial, B.I.2 (*códice de los músicos*)

T: Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de S. Lorenzo de El Escorial, T.I.1 (*códice rico*)

F: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale, Banco Rari, 20

² Now accessible through the Cantigas de Santa Maria Database (<http://csm.mml.ox.ac.uk>) and its pdf archive (<http://users.ox.ac.uk/~mmlcsm/cantigas>). The new edition is funded by British Academy grant BR 100062. For the principles and methods of the new edition see Parkinson (forthcoming a, b).

Figure 1: Cantiga 173

The man who suffered from a kidney stone

R *Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades
que sãar pod' os coitados / de todas enfermidades.*

A

1 Dest' avẽo un miragre / per com' eu oí dizer
a muitos omẽes bõos / e que eran de creer
que mostrou Santa Maria / por un seu serv' acorrer
onde gran torto faredes / se me ben non ascuitades.
Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades...

2 Est' ome d' Aragon era, / e avia tan gran mal
da pedra, que en gran coita / era con ela mortal
que comer sol non podia / nen dormir nen fazer al
senon chamar sempr' a Virgen / a Sennor das piadades.
Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades...

3 A muitos fisicos fora / mas non lle prestaran ren
por end' en Santa Maria / sa voontad' e seu sen
posera. E log' a Salas / se foi rogar a que ten
o mund' en seu mandamento / que non catass' sas maldades
Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades...

B

1 E que esto non dissesse / a outri, mas sa carreira
se foss'. E el espertou-se / enton e achou enteira
a pedra sigo na cama / tan grande que verdadeira-
ment' era come castanna / esto de certo sabiades.
Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades...

2 Enton el a Virgen muito / loou. E nos a loemos
por este tan gran miragre / e gran dereito faremos
ca sempr' ela nos acorre / enas coitas que avemos
ca a sa gran lealdade / passa todas lealdades.
Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades...

Metrics

A 15' 15' | 15 15 15 15'
 A A / b b b a

B 15' 15' | 15' 15' 15' 15'
 A A / b b b a

MS Variants

A1.4 ascuitades] **E** ascuitardes **T** alcuitardes (amended by superscript s) *The MS readings are grammatically correct but provide imperfect rhyme.*

A2.2 da] **E T** de A3.4 catass' sas] **E** catass as, **T** catas sas

B1.1 mas] **T** mais

Editorial variants

A2.2 da] **M** de

A3.4 catass' sas] **MI** catass' as I, **MII** catas' sas

Metrical

R.2]= pode_os

A 1.1] Desto_avêo per como_eu 1.3] = servo_acorrer

2.1] =Este_ome 2.4 sempre_a

3.2] por ende_en vo-on-ta-de 3.3] logo_a 3.4] mundo_en, catass(e) sas

B

1.2] =fosse_E 1.4 mente_era

2.3] = sempre_ela

Epigraph

Como santa maria de Salas guareceu ãu ome que auía a door que chaman da pedra

E] Selas

T] Como Santa Maria guareceu un ome que avia mal da pedra.

Captions (T)

a) Como un ome era doente da pedra e non achava fisico que lli des consello.

b) Como pos en seu coraçon se sãasse d'ir a Santa Maria en romaria.

c) Como se adormeceu des que ouve feita sa promisson.

d) Como s' espertou e achou a pedra na cama e el ficou sã.

e) Como foi en romaria a Santa Maria de Salas e a loou muito.

f) Como todos loaron muit' a Santa Maria polos muitos bẽes que faz.

sas maldades’, and the fourth begins with the end of an instruction to the man ‘E que esto non dissesse | a outri’. If this were its only defect, CSM 173 would remain as a case of disturbed transmission, and would remain incomplete until some enterprising editor composed the missing strophe or strophes. However, this is unlike any other case of textual lacuna in the CSM.³ The poem is found in the same defective state in the two manuscripts that transmit it, and, as Mettmann recognises, there is no textual indication that the scribes of either manuscript recognised the absence of text: ‘Falta aqui por lo menos una estrofa, sin que haya una laguna en los mss’ (1986-89, II, 180). In each case the poem appears without interruption and with the complete accompanying apparatus of epigraphs and music, and the normal decorative content of illustrative miniature and captions in T. The only obvious sign of textual disturbance is in the layout of the poem in MS T (f.230r), where it stands as one of the few cases of unexplained layout failure: instead of the text filling the entire manuscript page, as required by the layout programme of MS T (Parkinson 2000b, 245-46), the copy leaves three blank lines at the end of the final column. However, a closer inspection of the text and illustrations reveals a more complex set of relationships.

Narrative discontinuity and metrical hybridity in *cantiga* 173

If we look at the two halves of the textual narrative, as summarised in (2), we find a very large gap in the story:

2) Summary of narrative

R. Razom: the goodness of the Virgin performs healing miracles

A1. Introduction: the Virgin heals ‘un seu servo’ from Aragon

A2 Affliction: the man suffers from kidney stones, so badly that he cannot eat, drink or sleep; his only recourse is to pray to the Virgin

A3 Pilgrimage: doctors had failed him, so he goes to Salas to pray for forgiveness

B1 Cure: he is enjoined [in a dream?] to keep [the miracle] secret, and ‘go on his way’, and wakes up to find the kidney stone in his bed

B2 Praise: he praises the Virgin, and we should do so too.

The first half of the narrative (A1-3) describes the failure of medicine, the man’s decision to seek the help of the Virgin, and his departure to Salas. The text is ambiguous as to how or when he invoked the help of the Virgin: *a Salas se foi rogar...* probably means “he went and implored the Virgin” but could be interpreted as “he

³ More conventional *lacunae* are found in *cantigas* 341 (st. 10), 342 (st. 5), and 364 (st.7), where the single witness, E, has blank lines or erasures at the point of omission. Many poems in F are incomplete through loss of folios. No other *cantiga* has *lacunae* identified on textual grounds alone.

went to implore the Virgin”. The second half of the narrative (B1-2) recounts the end of a vision or dream of the Virgin, presumably after his arrival in Salas, in which she gives the surprising advice that he should go on his way quietly without telling anyone (of what remains unclear), after which he discovers himself healed and gives thanks.

If we look at the metrics of *cantiga* 173, we find that the narrative discontinuity is matched by a striking metrical hybridity. Like many poems in the latter part of the CSM, *cantiga* 173 is a zéjel in 15-syllable lines and the AA | bbba rhyme scheme. The same refrain is used throughout the poem

*Tantas en Santa Maria / son mercees e bondades
que sãar pod' os coitados / de todas enfermidades*

with all strophes integrated by the grave rhyme of the *vuelta* which prolongs the refrain rhyme in *-ades*.⁴ But the two halves of the text differ in one crucial respect: the three strophes preceding the *lacuna* have *agudo* (masculine) rhymes as the new metrical material in the body of the strophe (the *mudanzas*), while the two strophes following the *lacuna* have *grave* (feminine) rhymes. In terms of Mettmann’s inventory of frequent metrical schemes (1986-89, I, 42) the two parts of the *cantiga* are types XV and XIII respectively, as illustrated in (3) below.

(3) Metrical analysis of the two parts of *cantiga* 173

Strophes A1-3:	AA bbba	15' 15' 15 15 15 15' = Mettmann type XV
Strophes B1-2:	AA bbba	15' 15' 15' 15' 15' 15' = Mettmann type XIII ⁵

⁴ The ending *-ades* is used as rhyme in 24 *cantigas*: twice as refrain and *vuelta* (36, 173); once as the unrhymed refrain of a parallelistic *cantiga* (260), and 21 times in the body of the strophe (Betti 1997: 30-31). In only three cases (36, 173, 350) does a poem require more than three different rhyme-words for this rhyme, which marks it as relatively unproductive, despite the availability of two major categories of words (plurals of nouns in *-ade*, 2pl verb endings) which makes it not a difficult rhyme. (See Parkinson (1999) on the productivity of rhymes in the CSM.)

⁵ These formulae use the notation of Tavani. Grave (feminine) endings are represented by the prime “'”. Mettmann’s own rather opaque formulation for these schemes, in which italic rhyme letters indicate grave rhymes, and the rhyme scheme represents what in his layout are unrhymed half-lines, is:

XIII	<i>N' A' N' A' / n' b' n' b' n' b' n' a'</i>
XV	<i>N' A' N' A' n' b' n' b' n' b' n' a'</i>

This breaks one of the central metrical conventions of the *CSM*, that *grave* and *agudo* rhymes are never mixed in the same component of the rhyme scheme.⁶ Mettmann (1986-89, II, 180) omits the usual metrical analysis in the apparatus for this poem; had he included one he would have had to assign separate analyses for parts A and B.⁷

The metrical inconsistency of *cantiga* 173 leaves us with four hypotheses regarding its original form:

- a) the original was a metrically deficient *cantiga*, with a random alternation of *grave* and *agudo* rhymes, of which the portions preserved (around one or more *lacunae*)⁸ happen to fall neatly into the two types;
- b) the original had a systematic alternation of *grave* and *agudo* rhymes obscured by the *lacuna(e)* (for instance a six-strophe poem with blocks of three strophes in each type of rhyme, or a longer poem alternating pairs of strophes with *grave* or *agudo* rhymes);
- c) the *cantiga* is an example of a *continuation error*, in which one poet writes the opening strophes, setting the intended metrical pattern for the whole poem (in this case type XV), and the poets entrusted with completing the composition, after the *lacuna*, use a slightly different pattern, type XIII.
- d) the current form of the poem combines the beginning of one poem of type XV, combined with the end of a second related poem in type XIII.

There are no clear examples of cases (a) and (b) in the corpus of the *CSM*, and all other cases of continuation errors relate to line-length rather than rhyme scheme.⁹ Hypothesis (d), on the other hand, implies a situation which is documented elsewhere in the corpus of the *CSM*, namely the existence of multiple versions of the same miracle story.

6 Only one other poem, *cantiga* 282, mixes *grave* and *agudo* rhymes in this way. The first strophe uses the *grave* rhyme *-ee* (*merçee, cree, vee*) in the first strophe and *agudo* rhymes (*-ei, -i, -on, -ar* etc.) in the remaining six strophes. The versified title (Prólogo A) also has a mixture of *grave* and *agudo*, confirming its exclusion from the *CSM* proper (Parkinson 2010a). A few *cantigas* (21, 60, 70) seem to mix rhymes randomly, but are only apparent exceptions to the rule, as they have syllabic rather than an accentual-syllabic metrics, by which token the distinction between *grave* and *agudo* rhymes is bypassed. The alternation of *grave* and *agudo* rhymes is permissible in the Galician-Portuguese secular lyric. See Parkinson (1999, 2006, forthcoming b) for the metrical principles involved.

7 Betti's *Repertorio metrico* (2005: 19, 21, 56, 58, 123, 130, 187, 194) has no less than eight entries for this *cantiga*, under four versions of the rhyme-scheme: 41.88,112 (aaabbb, corresponding to Mettmann's AA|bbba); 59.80,104 (aaabcdbd=NaNa|bbba); 195.87,112 (abcdbbefff=AA|nbnbnbna); 200.83,108 (abcdbbefgfhf=NANA|nbnbnbna).

8 The possibility of further strophes being omitted cannot be excluded, as there is no syntactic continuity between stanzas A1, 2, and 3, or between stanzas B1 and 2.

9 See Parkinson 2007 for continuation confusions in *cantiga* 113; Parkinson 2010b discusses examples of metrical inconsistency in *cantigas* 32 and 72.

Parallel composition in the CSM

The clearest example of multiplication of narratives is the case of cantigas 242 and 249 (Parkinson 1998) which are parallel compositions based on the story of a stonemason protected by the Virgin from a potentially fatal fall. The two poems have the same location (Castroixeriz), the same subject matter (an accident befalling a stonemason working on the new church of the Virgin), the same metrical pattern (Mettmann type XIV, 15-syllable agudo lines with AA| bbba rhyme) with four b rhymes in common, and the same number of strophes (seven). CSM 249 is the more polished, and has a refrain which clearly matches its subject matter, while CSM 242 has more padding and a general purpose refrain:

(4) Refrains of CSM 249 and 242.¹⁰

249 Aquel que de voontade | Santa Maria servir
 d' ocajon será guardado | e doutro mal, sen mentir

242 O que no coraçõ d'ome | é mui duro de creer
 pode o Santa Maria | mui de ligeiro fazer

Parkinson (1998) concluded that two versions of the same miracle story were written, presumably with the intention of selecting the best for inclusion, and that both ended up being fed into the compilation process.¹¹ It should be noted that the story is a local miracle, without a source in the *mariale* tradition, and assigned to one of the Castilian shrines which Alfonso seems to have deliberately promoted against French and Galician rivals. It is precisely the kind of folktale miracle which the building of a new church would attract, and is consistent with the systematic multiplication of miracle stories needed to create a following for a favoured shrine.¹²

If we apply this model to cantiga 173, we can hypothesise the following initial stages:

- 1) identification or invention of a healing miracle assigned to Santa Maria de Salas
- 2) selection of a refrain and general metrical scheme
- 3) composition of two poems using the same refrain with two different types of *mudanzas*
- 4) accidental or deliberate combination of the two poems into a single cantiga

¹⁰ We follow MS F for the refrain of 242, against Mettmann (1986-9, II, 333) who follows E in reading “mui cruu de creer”.

¹¹ See Parkinson & Jackson, 160-61, for the distinction between collection, composition and compilation.

¹² Ward, 1982, 150-57, Parkinson 2011

The first stage is consistent with what is known of the collection policy of Alfonso X (Parkinson 2011). Of the Iberian *santuários* represented in the first half of the CSM, Santa Maria de Salas has the largest number of miracles attributed to it with 22 poems in all (20 in MS T), most of which belong to the third stage of compilation (the expansion to 200 poems, after the compilation of To and the adding of appendices to the original 100). *Cantiga* 173 is in fact in the middle of a concentrated sequence of thirteen Salas miracles, in the seventeenth and eighteenth decades of T: of the remaining 5 narrative poems from 161 to 179, two are quints (no. 165 associated with Byzantium, no. 175 with the Camino de Santiago), one is not localised (174) and the remainder are set in Spain (Cañete (162) Murcia (169)).¹³

Inside the 22 Salas miracles we find a number of recurring themes, which suggest one or more local miracle traditions.¹⁴ The revival of dead children is narrated in CSM 43, 118, 167, and 168, and the revival or return of animals in 44 (a hawk) and 178 (a mule). Cures of blindness or injury to the eyes appear in 129, 177, 247, and cures of lameness in 166, 179, kidney stones in 173. Injury or demonic possession is reversed in 109, 114, 189, 408, and a man struck dumb as a punishment for blasphemy has his speech restored in 163. People and their possessions are rescued from the elements in 161, 171, 172, and from false accusation or captivity in 164 and 176.

Refrains in Salas miracle poems (5) typically emphasise the Virgin's power, and the rewards of faithfulness.

(5) Refrains in Salas cantigas

- 161 Poder á Santa Maria | a Sennor de piadade
de defender toda terra | de mal e de tempestade
- 168 En todo logar á poder
A Virgen a quen quer valer
- 179 Ben sab' a que pod' e val / fisica celestial

The central block of Salas miracles, comprising thirteen poems located between nos. 161 and 179, are particularly closely linked, suggesting that they may be the work of a single poet or a dedicated team of poets.¹⁵ All of them conform to the pattern of the normal alfonsine *zéjel*, and most use 15-syllable lines, divided into equal hemistichs. Figure (6), shows the no. of poems and the no of strophes in each poem, and the code

¹³ Quints (Parkinson 2000b: 245) or *cantigas de numeración quinal* (Fernández Ordóñez 2011: 11) are long cantigas provided with a double page of miniatures in T and F. They appear as the fifth cantiga in every decade of T, and in the surviving quires of F.

¹⁴ See Aguado Bleye for the history of the shrine of Salas.

¹⁵ Other similarities can be found between poems of this group, such as the use of the verb *catar* (177 st. 6: *rogando de coraçõ // a Virgen Santa Maria | que o sãasse e non // catass' aos seus pecados*; 173 st. A3: *se foi rogar.. que non catass' sas maldades*), and auditory similes for sudden cures (163 st 3 *deu lle a lingua tal sãõ | como fogo que estala*; 179 st. 7: *os nervios ll' assi soaron | como carr' en pedregal*)

numbers assigned to these schemes by Mettmann (1986-89, I, 42), XIII for *grave* rhymes in the *mudanzas* and XIV and XV for *agudo* rhymes.

(6) metrical schemes for 12 Salas cantigas, 161-79

AA bbba	15' 15' 15' 15' 15' 15'	XIII	161 (8 str), 163 (5 str), 166 (4 str), 167 (7 str) 172 (6 str), 173B
AA bbba	15 15 15 15 15 15	XIV	177 (7 str) ¹⁶
AA bbba	15' 15' 15 15 15 15'	XV	164 (9 str), 173A, 176 (6 str), 178 (9str)
AA bbba	15 15 16 16 16 15		171 (7 str)
AA bbba	7 7 7' 7' 7' 7	II	179 (9 str)
AA bbba	8 8 8 8 8 8	III	168 (10 str)

This is in clear contrast to the metrical schemes of the earlier set of five poems (figure 7), of which only the first has the common scheme, and decasyllabic lines predominate

(7) metrical schemes in five early Salas cantigas

AA bbba	15' 15' 15' 15' 15' 15'	43 (15 str)
AA bbba	10 10 10 10 10 10	44 (9 str), 109 (10 str), 118 (8 str),
AA bbba	10' 10' 10' 10' 10' 10 ,	129 (7 str)

It seems likely, then, that the central block of 13 poems was elaborated at the same time, by a single poet or by a group working independently, to a generally standard metrical pattern, and were incorporated in the plan for MS T, broken up only by a few other poems needed to ensure the layout structure of MS T. It is quite likely that more poems were composed than were compiled, just as cantiga 408 (no 14 in F) eluded the compilers of MS E.

A third narrative?

Unlike the text, the six miniature panels tell a complete and coherent story. This version, however, does not correspond to the textual narrative, in particular as it has nothing to suggest a vision or dream, and involves the sufferer going to Salas after he is cured, not before. Figure 8 summarises the narrative of the panels.¹⁷

¹⁶ Mettmann's $N^7 A^7 N^7 A^7 | n^7 b^7 n^7 b^7 n^7 b^7 n^7 a^7$

¹⁷ Based on summaries by Deirdre Jackson for the Cantigas de Santa Maria database <http://csm.mml.ox.ac.uk>.

(8) Content of miniature panels (MS T f 230v)

- a) A man consults a doctor, who holds up a flask of urine and examines the contents. His patient clutches a small bag designed to hold the urine flask.
- b) The man sits up in bed, right hand pointing to himself, left hand open.
- c) The man sleeps peacefully, resting his chin on his hand.
- d) The man discovers a kidney stone amongst his bedclothes.
- e) He kneels and prays at an altar.
- f) He is joined by many other men who also pray at the altar and gaze reverently at the statue of the Virgin and Child.

The captions of the miniature (9) add some detail, by specifying that the man goes on his pilgrimage after the healing:

(9) Captions of miniature panels¹⁸

- a) *Como un ome era doente da pedra e non achava fisico que lli des[se] consello.*
- b) *Como pos en seu coração se sãasse d'ir a Santa Maria en romaria.*
- c) *Como se adormeceu des que ouve feita sa promisson.*
- d) *Como s' espertou a achou a pedra na cama e el ficou sã.*
- e) *Como foi en romaria a Santa Maria de Salas e a loou muito.*
- f) *Como todos loaron muit' a Santa Maria polos muitos bẽes que faz.*

Between the narrative text and the visual narrative with its captions there is a clear disagreement over the order of events and the precise nature of the miracle. In the text the pilgrimage to Salas appears to precede the healing, as the sick man decides to go to Salas to seek the help of the Virgin; in the caption narrative he promises to go to Salas as a condition of being healed, and the pilgrimage is a thank-offering.

This situation illustrates the complex relationship between text, image and caption in the *códices ricos*. Divergences between the textual and visual narratives are not uncommon, so we must assume that the artists constructed their narrative from a schematic form of the miracle story, in six tableaux, produced independently of the textual narrative. The captions of the miniatures (absent in many of the panels of MS F, and in some of the panels accompanying *cantigas de loor* in MS T) are one of the last paratextual elements to be inserted, and seem to have been drafted and executed in the scriptorium as a means of glossing the visual narrative, with occasional direct reference to the text.

In this case, the miniature captions make a coherent narrative of the six panels. The sequencing of the promissory gesture in panel b, the sleep and healing of panels c

¹⁸ Based on transcriptions by Roberto Ceolin for the Cantigas de Santa Maria database <http://csm.mml.ox.ac.uk>.

and d, and the prayer at an altar of the Virgin in panel e, is interpreted as a conditional vow of pilgrimage made immediately before sleep, followed by an instant miracle, and fulfilment of the vow. The term ‘vow’ (*promisson*) appears only in caption (c); the phrase used in caption b *pos en seu coração* has resonances of the text (*por end’ en Santa Maria / sa voontad’ e seu sen / posera*, 73:A3.2-3), though it uses a different value of the verb *poer*. A second resonance of the text is found in caption (e), where *e a loou muito* is added to the report of the pilgrimage, almost as an afterthought, reflecting B2.1 *Enton el a Virgen muito / loou*. While we cannot simply assume that the captions faithfully translate the artists’ brief, in this instance the correspondence between image and caption is close enough for them to be taken as a single narrative, and we can concentrate on the divergence between textual and visual narratives.

The two narratives represent two standard developments of healing miracles at shrines with a tradition of pilgrimage and votive offerings: either the sufferer goes to the shrine in the hope of a miracle, and makes a thank-offering when the miracle is performed, or they promise to make an appropriate thank-offering in return for a miracle, and complete (or not) the promise as a result. Both types of narrative sequence are found in the other narratives of healing in the Salas shrine group of cantigas, often involving the offering of a wax image representing the organ, person or animal healed.¹⁹

Compilation and recomposition

We now have a scenario in which two versions of the narrative sequence were developed, one by the artists and another in two versions by the poets. To explain how all three versions came to be present in MS T requires consideration of the processes underlying the production of the CSM collections, and the integration of text, music, and images.

The evidence of text-image discontinuities (Parkinson 2007) indicates that the panels of miniatures were planned at an early stage in the production process, before the text was finalised. The task of the miniature organiser was to reduce a given narrative to six visual moments (any one of which might have an internal time dimension) and instruct the artists accordingly. The text itself was subject to different constraints. Texts composed or adapted for inclusion in the codice rico T had to be of dimensions suitable for the page layout format for that MS, namely that the text and its music had to be contained in one or more whole pages of 88 columns (Parkinson 2000b, 247). A short poem would be laid out on a complete page, either entirely underlaid to music or with the first strophe underlaid. In the metre chosen for 173,

¹⁹ In CSM 166 a cripple promises to take a a pound of wax to Salas if he is healed, and is instantly made well; in 167 a moorish woman takes her dead son and a wax offering to Salas, where he is revived. There is no mention in cantiga 173 of the wax thank offering which is a feature of many Salas stories, but it is perhaps unsurprising, given that such offerings usually reflected the shape or weight of the organ or animal restored to health.

namely a strophe of four long lines and a refrain of two lines, which would be laid out in eight and four short lines respectively, the manuscripts show a clear preference for six-line poems (in which the initial refrain and the first strophe and refrain would be set on 10 staves, leaving 44 text lines for five strophes and four single-line truncated refrains) or seven-strophe poems (eight wide staves, and 52 lines for 6 strophes and 4 refrains), a preference mirrored in the line-lengths of the Salas poems (figure 6).²⁰ A five-strophe poem was slightly problematic, as it would need an extended stave (12 staves to leave 36 lines for four strophes and refrains) or excess space for the rubric (8 lines, as in cantiga 163), or would end up with the imperfect layout found in 173, in which the repetition form of the refrain alternates between one and two lines, and three blank lines are left at the end in testimony of a failure of the layout program. Four-strophe poems are generally avoided as over-short for layout purposes. The case of cantiga 113 (Parkinson 2007) shows that an overshoot poem could be expanded for compilation: in the case of cantiga 173 we may have the same problem resolved by combination.

(10) Narrative components of cantiga 173

		miniature	text1	text 2	text 173
A	Devotee of Virgin suffers from kidney stones,	a	1	1	A2
B	Goes to doctors, to no avail	a	2		A3
C	Goes to Salas to seek help from the Virgin		2	1	A3
D	Promises to go to Salas if healed	b			
E	He sleeps	c	3	2	
F	Virgin tells him that all will be all right if he keeps quiet			2-3	B1
G	He awakes and finds kidney stone in bed in the morning	d	3	3	B1
H	Goes to Salas	e			
I	Gives thanks	e	4	4	B2
J	All praise the virgin	f	4	4	B2

²⁰ See Parkinson 2000b, 255 for the layout mathematics of this form.

We can hypothesise, then, that the results of the composition phase were two poems, probably of four strophes each, representing two versions of the tale in which the Aragonese man goes to Salas to seek healing: in one he is healed as he sleeps, in the other he has a vision of the Virgin. At the same time, the miniaturists illustrated the other version of the tale, in which he promises to go to Salas if healed. The revisor of the poem demanded a six-strophe piece, for layout purposes. The scribe resolved to do this by adding an initial strophe linked to the refrain, using stock components of attestation, and by taking the first two strophes of version 1 and the last three from version 2; but his eye jumped to strophe 3 of version 2, influenced by the continuity of imperfect subjunctive forms *catasse* and *dissesse*, and only five strophes were included in the version passed to the copyists of T and E, the former laying out the still over-short piece as best he could. Meanwhile, the images for MS T had been planned on the basis of a different development of the tale. Figure 10 above identifies ten components in the basic narrative schema, and their appearance in the text and the miniature:

Conclusions

The current state of cantiga 173 bears witness to an anomalous textual history. The text of cantiga 173 is the rough forced marriage of the discontinuous parts of two earlier compositions, just as the criminal process known as “cut and shut” consists of the welding together of the halves of two stolen cars.²¹ To compound the confusion, the visual narrative uses a third development of the same schematic tale.

This account confirms the production model of Parkinson & Jackson, in which collection, composition, and compilation (with recomposition) are separate stages. Such a model, of workshop production rather than individual creation, should lead us to a radical reconsideration of any concepts of authorship. From the editorial point of view, cantiga 173 is as roadworthy as a cut-and-shut car, as its internal inconsistency makes it unfit for normal use as a performable text.

²¹ Cut and shut (n) A car produced by welding together the front section of one damaged or stolen car and the back section of another (OED Online, consulted 26 August 2009).

Works Cited

- Afonso X o Sábio. Walter Mettmann, ed. *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. 4 vols. Coimbra: Universidade, 1959-72.
- . Walter Mettmann, ed. *Cantigas de Santa María*. 3 vols. Madrid: Castalia, 1986-89.
- Del Cueto, Leopoldo. Marqués de Valmar, ed. *Cantigas de Santa María de don Alonso el Sabio*. Madrid: Real Academia Española, 1889. (Republished in 2 vols. Madrid: Caja de Ahorros y Monte de Piedad, 1990.)
- Aguado Bleye, Pedro. *Santa María de Salas en el Siglo XIII. Estudio sobre algunas Cantigas de Alfonso el Sabio*. Bilbao: Garmendía, 1916.
- Bertolucci, Valeria. "Primo contributo all' analisi delle varianti redazionali nelle Cantigas de Santa Maria." In Parkinson, ed. 2000. 106-18.
- Betti, Maria Pia. *Rimario e lessico in rima delle 'Cantigas de Santa Maria' di Alfonso X di Castiglia*. Pisa: Pacini, 1997.
- . *Repertorio metrico delle 'Cantigas de Santa Maria' di Alfonso X di Castiglia*. Pisa: Pacini, 2005.
- Cantigas de Santa Maria Database. <http://csm.mml.ox.ac.uk>.
- Edilan. *Cantigas de Santa María: Edición facsímil del Códice Rico T.I.1 de la Biblioteca de San Lorenzo el Real de El Escorial, Siglo XIII*. Madrid: Edilán, 1979.
- Fernández Fernández, Laura & Carlos Ruiz Souza, eds. *Alfonso X El Sabio: Las Cantigas de Santa María. Códice Rico MS T-I-1. Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de San Lorenzo de El Escorial. Vol II Estudios*. Madrid: Testimonio, 2011.
- Fernández Ordóñez, Inés. "Prólogo. Las Cantigas de Santa María en el marco de las producciones alfonsíes: semejanzas y diferencias." In Fernández Fernández & Ruiz Souza, eds. 2011. II, 5-15.
- Ferreira, Manuel Pedro. "A música das cantigas galego-portuguesas: balanço de duas décadas de investigação (1977-1997)." In Flitter & Odber de Baubeta. 1998. 58-71.
- . "Andalusian Music and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." In Parkinson, ed. 2000. 7-19.
- . "A notação musical das Cantigas de Santa Maria." In *Aspectos da Música Medieval no Ocidente Peninsular*. Lisbon: Fundação Couste Gulbenkian, 2009. 180-95.
- Flitter, Derek W., & Patricia Odber de Baubeta, eds. *Ondas do Mar de Vigo. Actas do Simposio Internacional sobre a Lírica Medieval Galego-Portuguesa, Birmingham 1998*. Birmingham: Seminario de Estudios Galegos, Department of Hispanic Studies, University of Birmingham, 1998.
- Menéndez Pidal, Gonzalo. "Los manuscritos de las *Cantigas*. Cómo se elaboró la miniatura alfonsí." *Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia* 150 (1962): 25-51.

- Montero Santalha, José-Martinho. "A estrutura métrico-rimática da cantiga 100 das Cantigas de Santa Maria." In Boris N. Komissarov, ed. *No espaço lusófono: materiais e artigos*. St Petersburg: University: 2003. 220-32.
- Nelson, Charles L. "Art and Visualization in the Cantigas de Santa Maria: How the Artists Worked." In Israel. J. Katz & John E. Keller, eds. *Studies on the 'Cantigas de Santa María': Art, Music and Poetry*. Madison: Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 1987. 111-34.
- Parkinson, Stephen. "False refrains in the Cantigas de Santa Maria." *Portuguese Studies* 3 (1987): 21-55.
- . "Two for the price of one: on the Castroxerix *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." In Flitter & Odber de Baubeta. 1998. 72-88.
- . "Meestria métrica: metrical virtuosity in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." *La corónica* 27.2 (1999): 21-35.
- , ed. *Cobras e Son . Papers on the Text, Music and Manuscripts of the 'Cantigas de Santa Maria'*. Oxford: Legenda, 2000.
- . "Layout and Structure of the Toledo Manuscript of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." In Parkinson, ed. 2000, 133-53.
- . "Layout in the códices ricos of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." *Hispanic Research Journal* 1 (2000): 243-74.
- . "The Evolution of *Cantiga* 113: Composition, Recomposition, and Emendation in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." *La corónica* 37.2 (2007): 227-72.
- . "Front matter or text? Prologues and tables of contents in the compilations of the 'Cantigas de Santa Maria.'" In Devid Paolini, ed. *Estudios celestinescos y medievales en honor del profesor Joseph Thomas Snow*. New York: The Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 2010. II, 252-65.
- . "Questões métricas nas *Cantigas de Santa Maria*: estruturas múltiplas, assimetrias e continuidades inconsistentes." In Mariña Arbor Aldea & Antonio F. Guiadanes, eds. *Estudios de edición crítica e lírica medieval galego-portuguesa. Verba* (Anexo 67). Santiago de Compostela: Universidade, 2010. 315-36.
- . "Alfonso X, Miracle Collector." In Laura Fernández Fernández & Carlos Ruiz Souza, eds. *Alfonso X El Sabio: Las Cantigas de Santa María*. Madrid: Testimonio, 2011. II, 341-57.
- . "Towards a new edition of the Cantigas de Santa Maria." In Jane Whetnall, ed. *Papers from the 17th Colloquium*. London: Queen Mary, University Of London. Forthcoming.
- . "Voz e Letra da lírica galego-portuguesa." In *Voz. Actas do VII colóquio da seccão Portuguesa da Associação Hispânica de Literatura Medieval*. Lisbon: Caminho. Forthcoming.
- Parkinson, Stephen, & Deirdre Jackson. "Collection, composition, and compilation in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*." *Portuguese Studies* 22 (2006): 159-72.
- Schaffer, Martha E. "Los códices de las 'Cantigas de Santa María': su problemática."

- In Jesús Montoya Martínez & Ana Domínguez Fernández. *El Scriptorium alfonsí*. Madrid: Editorial Complutense, 1999. 127-48.
- . "The 'Evolution' of the Cantigas de Santa Maria: The Relationships between Manuscripts T, F, and E." In Parkinson, ed. 2000, 186-213.
- Tavani, Giuseppe. *Repertorio metrico delle lirica galego-portoghese*. Rome: Ateneo, 1967.
- Ward, Benedicta. *Miracles and the Medieval Mind: Theory, Record and Event, 1000-1215*. London: Scholar Press, 1982.